# agenda

Subject: Marin Transit Ad Hoc Committee on School Transportation

Location: Marin County Civic Center, Room 324A (Rug Room)

3501 Civic Center Drive, San Rafael

Date: Monday, April 3, 2017

Time: **11:00 AM – 12:30 PM** 

- 1. Introductions
- 2. Status of Near Term Action Items
  - a. Ross Valley School Service (oral report)
  - b. Transition of Rt. 115 Serving St. Hilary's School (Attachment)
  - c. Larkspur Corte Madera School Service (oral report)
  - d. Later Start Proposals Sir Francis Drake and Novato High Schools (oral report)
- 3. Revised Draft Guiding Principles for Advancing the Implementation Plan (Attachment)
- 4. Cost Estimate for Yellow Bus Program Management (Attachment)
- 5. Youth Fare Discussion (Attachment)
- 6. Summary of TAM/Marin Transit Presentations to Cities and Towns (Attachment)
- 7. Future Ad Hoc Committee Meetings



ph: 415.226.0855 fax: 415.226.0856 marintransit.org April 3, 2017

Student Transportation Ad Hoc Committee Marin County Transit District 3501 Civic Center Drive San Rafael, CA 94903

# SUBJECT: Summary of Supplemental Route 115 discontinuation

Dear Ad Hoc Committee Members:

#### board of directors

katie rice president supervisor district 2

stephanie moulton-peters vice president city of mill valley

damon connolly 2nd vice president supervisor district 1

judy arnold director supervisor district 5

kate colin director city of san rafael

dennis rodoni director supervisor district 4

kathrin sears director supervisor district 3 **BACKGROUND:** For many years, Marin Transit has provided service to St. Hilary School in Tiburon with various Supplemental public transit routes. Originally, service area extended from near the Golden Gate Bridge through Sausalito, Mill Valley and into Tiburon by way of Strawberry. Over time, the service has been truncated due to declining ridership. Today, trips on the Route 115 that serve St. Hilary serve Marin City, Downtown Mill Valley, Strawberry and the Tiburon Peninsula.

Route 115's overall productivity in FY15/16 was 16.8 passengers per trip and trips to St. Hilary contribute to this low ridership. Based on your Board's adopted productivity target of 20 passengers per trip, the route no longer meets this target. In addition, in the Coordinated Countywide School Transportation Study (CCSTS), Route 115 was identified as a route that should be discontinued as St. Hilary School is the only private school served by a Supplemental School route and one of the few still serving elementary aged students.

Discontinuing Route 115 will help Marin Transit achieve other goals set out in the CCSTS such as matching most appropriate service to the age of the students and focusing supplemental school resources at the High school level.

**TRANSITION SUMMARY:** At the September 15, 2016, Schools Ad Hoc Committee meeting of the Marin Transit Board staff presented a Proposed 2016-17 Marin Transit Action Plan. Item 6 of the plan recommended staff to work with the school to transition St. Hilary school riders to a different service controlled by the school and reallocating resources to the overcrowded high school routes. Since that meeting, Marin Transit staff have undertaken the following actions in order to accomplish this goal.

On November 15, Marin Transit staff met with St. Hilary administration to notify them that the Route 115 was

underperforming and would be discontinued at the end of the 2016/17 school year. Marin Transit staff provided St. Hilary staff with three options that they could explore so that they could continue to provide a transportation service to students:

- Pursue a partnership with Mill Valley School district's yellow bus program
- Pursue a partnership with the Tiburon Traffic Relief JPA yellow bus program
- Contact other yellow bus vendors including CYO Transportation for pricing options to provide service independently

A partnership between St. Hilary's and the Tiburon Traffic Relief JPA was not possible because of the bell time alignments between the various schools which meant that a bus would not be available at the times when St. Hilary students would need to be transported to or from school. St. Hilary's also reached out to CYO for pricing but they are continuing to pursue a partnership first.

The Mill Valley School District is the best partnership opportunity for morning only service as the bell times for MVMS and Edna Maguire are later than the St. Hilary School bell time. Marin Transit staff have developed a service plan for one bus to serve the current Route 115 alignment in the mornings to St. Hilary School. The bus then returns to downtown Mill Valley to begin the morning route serving MVMS and Edna Maguire.

On January 20, 2017, Marin Transit staff met with the MVSD staff to present the draft service plan with expanded morning only service to St. Hilary school. This plan could be advantageous for MVSD since it will allow the school district to raise more revenue through additional pass sales. MVSD was interested in moving forward to explore the idea and asked Marin Transit to further refine the plan. During the week of February 13, Marin Transit staff performed several test runs of the route to confirm route timing and to ensure that during normal school day traffic the bus could serve St. Hilary without negatively impacting the existing operations for MVSD. The tests confirmed the viability of the service plan.

Now, Marin Transit in partnership with MVSD is working with the contractor, Michael's Transportation, to determine any contract modifications and cost impacts that may occur as a result of incorporating the St. Hilary route into the existing contract.

**NEXT STEPS:** Once the contract specifications are finalized then MVSD will need to make a final decision whether to partner with St. Hilary School or not. If approved, an agreement between the two entities will need to be drafted and signed and St. Hilary pass sales and distribution will need to be defined. Marin Transit is not in a position to offer program oversight and support to St. Hilary's at this time so management of the new route, if implemented, would need to be administered by others.

Respectfully submitted,

Kelly Zalewski

**School Operations Analyst** 

Keliy Zalwoki



ph: 415.226.0855 fax: 415.226.0856 marintransit.org April 3, 2017

Student Transportation Ad Hoc Committee Marin County Transit District 3501 Civic Center Drive San Rafael, CA 94903

**SUBJECT:** Revised Draft Guiding Principles for Implementing a Student Transportation Program

Dear Ad Hoc Committee Members:

board of directors

katie rice president supervisor district 2

stephanie moulton-peters vice president city of mill valley

damon connolly 2nd vice president supervisor district 1

judy arnold director supervisor district 5

kate colin director city of san rafael

dennis rodoni director supervisor district 4

kathrin sears director supervisor district 3 **BACKGROUND:** Based on the Ad Hoc Committee's interest in establishing guiding principles for the future development of a countywide school transportation program, staff presented draft guiding principles to the Committee on February 8, 2017. The Ad Hoc Committee discussed the draft principles and provided comments. The comments have been incorporated into the attached revised version of the guiding principles.

The revised draft continues to reflect several of the findings and conclusions from the School Transportation Study and builds on those by identifying more specifics on how future investments could be prioritized.

**Ad Hoc Committee Role:** Provide additional feedback on the Draft Guiding Principles and advise staff as to whether a final set of Guiding Principles should be considered for adoption by the Marin Transit Board of Directors.

Respectfully submitted,

Mancy E. Tehelan

Nancy Whelan General Manager

Attachment: Draft Guiding Principles -- Revised

#### **School Transportation in Marin County**

#### **Guiding Principles**

In December 2015, Marin Transit completed the Coordinated Countywide Student Transportation Study. Key objectives of the study were to identify options to relieve roadway congestion while encouraging healthy mobility choices for Marin County students. The study resulted in several recommendations, some of which have been implemented within existing funding. Additional funding is needed to expand student transportation as recommended in the study.

The purpose of these guiding principles is to provide a broad framework for future implementation actions.

- Maintaining and enhancing bus service for students is a high priority as these services contribute significantly to reducing peak hour roadway congestion.
- As one of the more cost effective means of busing students, the existing county-wide fixed route system with a youth fare and discounted youth pass will continue to be supported. Expansion of the school bus service shall be accomplished using the most cost-effective model available.
- A mix of yellow school buses and public transit "school tripper" service will best meet the need to enhance student transportation in the County.
- Yellow school buses are designed to meet the needs of younger (K-8) students while public transit buses are better suited to serve high school students.
- Bus service should complement Safe Routes to School program and focus on serving the
  greatest number of students living beyond walking and biking distance to schools. This focus
  helps remove the most cars from our roadways.
- The organization structure for the governance, management, and planning of student transportation services shall foster participation by all stakeholders.
- All stakeholders will need to work toward identifying new funding to sustain and enhance current school transportation services.
- Decisions to allocate transportation resources shall be based on objective criteria, including:
  - o Ridership, which represents auto trips eliminated from roads.
  - Subsidy per trip, which reflects public resources needed relative to user payment for the trip.
  - Willingness of schools and school districts to adjust bell times, adjust calendars, establish district boundaries, set enrollment policies supporting neighborhood schools, sponsor the Safe Routes to School program and support the youth transit pass program, as these factors heavily influence the cost effectiveness of a busing program.
  - Investments made by schools and school districts in operating current yellow bus programs shall be recognized if new public transportation funds become available for distribution.

- Public transportation dollars shall benefit students equitably across the county.
- Public schools shall be the focus of a countywide school transportation program.
- While transit is typically a pay as you go model (single trip fare) and yellow bus services require longer commitments (semester or annual pass), per trip fares should be comparably priced, while reflecting the premium nature of the reserved-seat yellow bus system.
- Fare and pass pricing structures shall provide reduced rates for those who are least able to pay.





ph: 415.226.0855 fax: 415.226.0856 marintransit.org April 3, 2017

Student Transportation Ad Hoc Committee Marin County Transit District 3501 Civic Center Drive San Rafael, CA 94903

**SUBJECT: Description of Marin Transit Staff – Program Management Budget Worksheet** 

Dear Ad Hoc Committee Members:

**BACKGROUND:** Marin Transit initially developed cost estimates for staff support for yellow bus programs for the Tiburon JPA and Mill Valley School District (MVSD). These cost allocations divided the total costs of one new staff member and divides this cost based on each program's share of buses. Respectively, these contracts were executed for \$45,000 for the Tiburon JPA and \$13,000 for Mill Valley for staff time to support the operations of the two programs.

Since the beginning of the programs, Marin Transit has tracked actual staff time allocated to yellow bus program support. This staff time includes not only the new dedicated position, but additional staff time associated with administering and supporting the program. With this information, staff has developed a worksheet to more accurately forecast time to be spent on supporting all aspects of the yellow bus programs. In tracking the time spent on the programs, it was clear that it was necessary to forecast time in two distinct buckets; time associated with annual program start-up and ongoing monitoring.

The attachment shows how staff translated the total amount of time spent on the various yellow bus programs in 2016/17 into specific tasks and assigned dollar values to those tasks. Using this breakdown, we have estimated the staff time costs to manage the yellow bus programs in 2017/18. Staff is using this methodology to develop new operations support contracts for MVSD and the Tiburon JPA.

Respectfully submitted,

Respectfully submitted

Kelly Zalewski School Operations Analyst

Kelly Zalwoki

#### board of directors

katie rice president supervisor district 2

stephanie moulton-peters vice president city of mill valley

damon connolly 2nd vice president supervisor district 1

judy arnold director supervisor district 5

kate colin director city of san rafael

dennis rodoni director supervisor district 4

kathrin sears director supervisor district 3

Marin Transit Staff - Program Management Budget Worksheet				2016/17 Estimated Actuals			2017/18 Estimates		
F			RUSD	RVSD	MVSD	RUSD	RVSD	MVSD	
			buses	7	6	2	7	6	2
			new routes	0	0	6	0	0	0
			Existing routes	26	17	0	25	17	6
			one way passes	1434	991	257	1400	970	260
			Ride along days	3	2	3	1	1	3
Basis for Estimates Meetings					3	5	5	3	2
Sta	rtup								
\$	1,000	annual, per route	(new) route design, operations data	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 6,000.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
\$	250	annual, per route	(update) route design, operations data	\$ 6,500.00	\$ 4,250.00	\$ -	\$ 6,250.00	\$ 4,250.00	\$ 1,500.00
\$		annual	website development	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 5,000.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
\$	1,200	annual	website updates	\$ -	\$ 1,200.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 1,200.00	\$ 1,200.00
\$	5	per pass	pass production	\$ -	\$ 4,955.00	\$ 1,285.00	\$ -	\$ 4,850.00	\$ 1,300.00
\$	5	per pass	pass distribution	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 1,285.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 1,300.00
\$	650	daily	bus ridealongs, per bus	\$ 13,650.00	\$ 5,200.00	\$ 3,900.00	\$ 4,550.00	\$ 3,900.00	\$ 3,900.00
\$	20,000	annual	app support, day 1 ready	\$ 20,000.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
\$	2,500	annual	app support, day 3 ready	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 2,500	\$ -	\$ -
\$	10	per pass	Customer service	\$ -	\$ 9,910.00	\$ 2,570.00	\$ -	\$ 9,700.00	\$ 2,600.00
\$	1,000	annual	parking coordination	+ -,	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	\$ -	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ -
			Total: Startup	\$ 41,150.00	\$ 26,515.00	\$ 20,040.00	\$ 14,300.00	\$ 24,900.00	\$ 11,800.00
On	going Mo	nitoring							
\$	175	month, per route	operations monitoring with passenger information, parent communication	\$ 45,500.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 43,750.00	\$ -	\$ -
\$	150	month, per route	operations monitoring, parent communication	\$ -	\$ 25,500.00	\$ 9,000.00	\$ -	\$ 25,500.00	\$ 9,000.00
\$	15	per pass	Customer service	\$ -	\$ 14,865.00	\$ 3,855.00	\$ -	\$ 14,550.00	\$ 3,900.00
\$		annual	credit card processing	\$ -	\$ 1,500.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 1,500.00	\$ -
\$	1,500	annual	admin, coordination	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 1,500.00
\$	200.00	per meeting	meetings	\$ 2,000.00		\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 600.00	\$ 400.00
			Total: Ongoing Monitoring	\$ 49,000.00	\$ 43,965.00	\$ 15,355.00	\$ 46,250.00	\$ 43,650.00	\$ 14,800.00
			Total	\$ 90,150.00	\$ 70,480.00	\$ 35,395.00	\$ 60,550.00	\$ 68,550.00	\$ 26,600.00
			FY 16/17 Operational Support Contract Amount	\$45,000	\$ -	\$13,000			

3/31/2017



ph: 415.226.0855 fax: 415.226.0856 marintransit.org April 3, 2017

Student Transportation Ad Hoc Committee Marin County Transit District 3501 Civic Center Drive San Rafael, CA 94903

**SUBJECT: Discussion of Youth Fare Policy** 

Dear Ad Hoc Committee Members:

# Overview: As part of the upcoming Short Range Transit Plan update, staff will present the Board of Directors with options for revising the District's overall fare structure with the goal of providing equity among riders, recognizing that different services have different costs and provide varied levels of convenience to the passenger. A further goal of the fare structure revision is to more directly address discounted pricing for low income riders. An

directly address discounted pricing for low income riders. An element of this overall effort is evaluating youth fare pricing.

## board of directors

katie rice president supervisor district 2

stephanie moulton-peters vice president city of mill valley

damon connolly 2nd vice president supervisor district 1

judy arnold director supervisor district 5

kate colin director city of san rafael

dennis rodoni director supervisor district 4

kathrin sears director supervisor district 3

## Youth Fare Policy - Marin Transit

Marin Transit currently supports a youth fixed route fare that is 50% of the adult fare, or \$1.00 per trip. Daily, weekly, and monthly passes are also available at 50% of the adult pass price. Additionally, Marin Transit offers an annual and six-month Youth Transit Pass.

Category	Cash	6 Month	1-Day	7-Day	31-Day
	Price	Pass <sup>(1)</sup>	Pass	Pass	Pass
Youth (5-18)	\$1.00	\$175 <sup>(1)</sup>	\$2.50	\$10	\$40

(1) Free to low income youth. \$325 for a year.

In Fiscal Year 2015-16, over 3,900 youth pass "stickers" were distributed to 28 participating public and private schools. About 94% of these passes were distributed to income qualified students for free.

Comparing yellow bus to transit per trip fares shows that yellow bus riders pay between \$1.11 and \$1.94 while students riding school trippers or regular fixed route service pay \$.90 to \$1.00.

## Coordinated Countywide School Transportation Study

One of the recommended near term action items in the Coordinated Countywide School Transportation Study, completed in 2015, was to better align supplemental transit and yellow bus fares. Specifically the report stated that:

The discrepancy in pricing encourages schools and parents to campaign for or select a mode for their students based on pricing rather than based on the optimum service for the age of the student served. This problem could be eliminated if Marin transit revised its youth fares on public transit to be more consistent with yellow bus rates and other countywide transit agencies in the Bay Area.

## Guiding Principles

The Ad Hoc Committee is considering draft Guiding Principles for future development of the countywide school transportation program. Two of the draft principles concern fares and pricing:

- While transit is typically a pay as you go model (single trip fare) and yellow bus services require longer commitments (semester or annual pass), per trip fares should be comparably priced, while reflecting the premium nature of the reserved-seat yellow bus system.
- Fare and pass pricing structures shall provide reduced rates for those who are least able to pay.

#### Youth Fare Policy - Other Bay Area Agencies

A review of youth fares at other transit agencies shows that only AC Transit and Muni provide youth discounts equal to or lower than the discount provided by Marin Transit. Other Bay Area transit youth fares range from 63% to 100% of the adult fare, with the average being 81%. SFMTA appears to be the only other Bay Area transit agency that offers a reduced fare for low income students.

Agency	Adult Fare	Youth Fare	Youth Fare % Adult Fare	Youth Age
AC Transit	\$2.10	\$1.05	50%	13-17
County Connection	\$2.00	\$2.00	100%	Over 6
Dixon Readi Ride	\$2.00	\$1.75	88%	5-17
Fairfield and Suisun Area Transit	\$1.50	\$1.50	100%	13-17
Livermore Amador Valley Transit	\$2.00	\$2.00	100%	Over 6
Petaluma Transit	\$1.25	\$1.00	80%	N/A
Delta Breeze	\$1.75	\$1.75	100%	Over 4
SamTrans	\$2.00	\$1.25	63%	Under 17
Santa Rosa City Bus	\$1.50	\$1.25	83%	5-18
SolTrans	\$1.75	\$1.50	86%	6-18
SFMTA	\$2.25	\$0.75	33%	5-17
Sonoma County Transit	\$1.25	\$1.05	84%	6-18
Tri-Delta Transit	\$2.00	\$2.00	100%	Over 5
Union City Transit	\$2.00	\$1.25	63%	6-17
Vacaville City Coach	\$1.50	\$1.25	83%	6-18
Napa Vine	\$1.50	\$1.00	67%	6-18
VTA	\$2.00	\$1.75	88%	5-17
WestCat	\$1.75	\$1.75	100%	Over 6

Source: Statistical Summary of Bay Area Transit Operators July 2015

**Options for Discussion:** The options in the table below illustrate examples of youth fare pricing scenarios for fixed route that may be considered in conjunction with Marin Transit's overall fare structure. These options are provided to stimulate discussion by the Ad Hoc Committee.

		Single Ride <sup>1</sup>	Monthly Pass	Annual Pass	Low Income Pass
Option 1	Eliminate all youth pricing	\$2.00	\$60	Not Available	Not Available
Option 2	Eliminate youth pricing on single ride but still provide an annual pass and a half price low income pass	\$2.00	\$60	\$500	\$250
Option 3	Phase youth price increase over two years	\$1.50 year 1 \$2.00 year 2	\$45 year 1 \$60 year 2	\$375 year 1 \$500 year 2	\$160 year 1 \$250 year 2

<sup>1.</sup> Single rides on fixed route currently receive a 10% discount (\$1.80). Discounts for using Clipper may also be included as part of the larger fare study.

Respectfully submitted,

Barbara Duffy

Deputy General Manager

Baler Lifty



ph: 415.226.0855 fax: 415.226.0856 marintransit.org February 8, 2017

Student Transportation Ad Hoc Committee Marin County Transit District 3501 Civic Center Drive San Rafael, CA 94903

# **SUBJECT: Public Information on School Transportation Programs**

Dear Ad Hoc Committee Members:

## board of directors

katie rice president supervisor district 2

stephanie moulton-peters vice president city of mill valley

damon connolly 2nd vice president supervisor district 1

judy arnold director supervisor district 5

kate colin director city of san rafael

dennis rodoni director supervisor district 4

kathrin sears director supervisor district 3 **BACKGROUND:** At the Ad Hoc Committee meeting on February 8, 2017 Marin Transit staff provided a draft fact sheet on school transportation to be used as a tool by staff and board members to educate the public about Marin Transit's student transportation programs. The goal of the final document(s) is to educate the reader on the wide range of programs available and the success of these programs.

The Ad Hoc Committee suggested that the materials be tailored to each community to provide information to which each city, town, and school district could easily relate. Subsequent to the Ad Hoc Committee meeting, the Transportation Authority of Marin (TAM) Board Chair and staff invited Marin Transit staff to participate in presentations to cities and towns on transportation needs and funding. The powerpoint presentations have information specific to each jurisdiction with a focus on the Measure A sales tax services and benefits. Attached are the slides on school transportation and Safe Routes to Schools programs presented to Corte Madera, Ross, Tiburon, and San Anselmo over the past month. Additional presentations are scheduled for the remaining Marin County cities and towns over the next several weeks.

Marin Transit is in the process of engaging a firm to assist with public relations strategies and messaging to improve its visibility in the communities it serves. The first task the firm will work on is developing materials regarding school programs. They will help us hone the message for the upcoming powerpoint presentations and develop facts sheets and other materials. They will use the research data presented to the Ad Hoc Committee in February as a resource for crafting broad messages as well as specifically targeted messages.

**Ad Hoc Committee Role:** Staff is seeking further input on the types of materials and information that would be most useful to

communicate the benefits of school transportation services and needs for additional services.

Respectfully submitted,

Nancy & . Tuhulan

Nancy Whelan

General Manager

Attachment: PowerPoint slides









# Sample Slides

Transit and Safe Routes to School Elements of Presentations to Cities and Towns



Making the Most out of Marin Transportation Dollars











## Marin Transit Serves San Anselmo

## **Student Transportation**

- Routes 23, 23X, 68, 125: 1,263 passenger trips a day
- Yellow Bus:
  - White Hill Middle School: 931 annual one way passes
  - Hidden Valley Elementary: 60 annual one way passes
- COM Pass Program:
  - 4,000 passes issued
  - 500 daily trips taken





Making the Most out of Marin Transportation Dollars











## **Marin Transit Serves Tiburon**

## **Student Transportation**

#### **Route 119 - Redwood HS**

• 170+ daily trips

#### **Reed Unified Yellow Bus**

 Operations Management for the Tiburon Yellow Bus JPA





Making the Most out of Marin Transportation Dollars











## Marin Transit Serves Ross Valley

## **Student Transportation**

- Routes 23, 23X, 68, 125:
   1,263 passenger trips a day
- Yellow Bus:
  - White Hill Middle School: 991 annual one way passes
  - Hidden Valley Elementary: 60 annual one way passes
- COM Pass Program:
  - 4,000 passes issued
  - 500 daily trips taken





Making the Most out of Marin Transportation Dollars











## Marin Transit Serves Corte Madera

## **Student Transportation**

- Redwood High School:
   250 passenger trips a day
- Cove, Neil Cummins and Hall Middle School:
   187 passenger trips per day
- Youth discount passes:
   208 annual passes





Making the Most out of Marin Transportation Dollars











# Strategy 4- Safe Routes to School

The Safe Pathways program is a very popular element to safe routes - making sure pathways for biking and walking to school are available and safe.

### **Key Projects in Tiburon**

- \$116,000 Greenwood Cove/Blackfield Bike/Ped Improvements
- \$25,000 Ned's Way Rectangular Rapid Flashing Beacon
- \$100,639 Mar West Street Improvements
- Pine Terrace ADA Improvements



Existing condition



Making the Most out of Marin Transportation Dollars















